OFFICES OF PLANNING COMMISSION PO BOX 715 EAST DORSET, VT 05253 TELEPHONE (802) 362-4571

FAX (802) 362-5156

## DORSET DESIGN REVIEW BOARD January 6, 2020

Members present: Kit Wallace, (Chairperson arrived 15 minutes late) Michelle Pagán, Arnie Gottlieb, acting Chair, Lindy Bowden, Jim Clubb and Ruth Tanenhaus (Alternate)

Also present: Tyler Yandow, Zoning Administrator, Bob Escher for the applicant, and Lawrence Caruso.

Minutes: R. Nawrath

Acting Chair A. Gottlieb opened the meeting at 5:35 PM

These minutes are an addition to the last meeting's minutes of November 18, 2019. This is a special meeting as requested.

## <u>Application: Lawrence Caruso – Village Residential – Replace screen door and add storm windows</u> 330 Church Street

Larry Caruso moved into the old icehouse on Church Street. In the old days, ice was harvested from the pond and stored in the icehouse. It's an old house but was updated extensively by the previous owners. Mr. Caruso wants to replace the door on the front of the house. He will be replacing the door with the same design of wooden door and it will be painted Essex Green.

The applicant wishes to install a wooden screen storm door to replace the existing warped door with like for like. Additionally, he would like to install six wood framed storm/screen windows as follows:

- One in the laundry room, which is a small window that you can't see from the street. It faces west.
- Five in the master bedroom which includes 2 on the roadside and 3 on the backside (which can't be seen from the street).

The screen door will be replaced with the same kind of door; "replacing like with like". Larry brought in one of the storm windows for us to see the wooden construction and that they would not obscure the historic windows of the house. Photographs and location were also provided for all windows which storm doors will be installed.

J. Clubb moved to accept the application as presented R. Tanenhaus 2<sup>nd</sup> Approved unanimously

## <u>Application: Clarification - Michael and Carol Smith - Village Residential - General Renovations</u> 40 Cheney Road

Bob Escher requested this special meeting of the DRB for clarification of several points from the last DRB meeting and from the last meeting of the PC.

Bob indicated the replacement windows will not be 'true divided lights' as preferred by the Historic District guidelines as noted in the previous minutes. Instead they will be simulated divided lights Marvin windows

which will be stone white metal on the outside and wood on the inside with 'spacers' to provide the illusion of divided lights and muntin bars identical in size to the historic windows. Similar construction and configuration have been previously approved by the DRB.

Tyler Yandow asked for a clarification of the application, which didn't mention **all** windows were to be replaced. Bob Escher read from the application which stated, in part, 'new windows' and he meant all windows in the original 1920's part of the house will be replaced.

Jim Clubb asked for clarification of the sizes of the replacement windows proposed versus the size of the existing windows based on the description provided in Bob's memo provided of 14 December 2019. A lengthy discussion occurred to understand exactly what was proposed for all windows, particularly those visible from the street.

In each case the height of each window is the same from the old to the new; however, the glass in the new windows are is slightly narrower (a maximum of 2.75"/window). Given that the windows currently have storm windows which obscure part of the historic windows and those storms will be removed, the visual look of the windows from the street will change little. In the case of all windows, Bob indicated the configuration will be the same (eg 12/12 or 9/9) including the cottage style windows (those of unequal size on the bottom and the top).

During the original review in November, the DRB asked that the new windows be within an inch of the original window size. The actual proposed windows are slightly over this margin of change but with the storm window removal as noted above the visual will be only slightly different.

Due to the lengthy verbal discussion to understand the change proposed for each window, the DRB asked that for the Planning Commission meeting, each window be numbered on the drawing that is submitted for approval. Bob agreed to circulate on Tuesday morning to the DRB members to ensure that it is consistent with what was presented and agreed to at the meeting given the lack of clarity of the submitted written documents.

Bob Escher said that, since the November meeting, there was one other issue not mentioned during the first hearing as the kitchen design hadn't been finalized at that point. The interior design has now been finalized which will require an exterior change. During the November meeting there were two groups of three windows proposed in the kitchen; the current drawings submitted show two one group. Please refer to the new drawing as submitted January 6, 2020. D-100

Jim Clubb asked if there was anything else in the November application that needed to be changed. The Board revisited the issue of the garage doors and using the original hinges. Bob said the hinges on the garage door will remain be reused on the new doors. Mr. Clubb asked if the garage door will "roll" up as the drawing seemed to indicate or will it be one solid piece of wood as noted in the November minutes. Mr. Escher said he meant to indicate a roll up style door with 4 sections that he thought will not be particularly visible from the street. Mr. Clubb said that the original minutes stated that the garage door would "be a single piece of wood (not roll ups) ...".

Mr. Clubb thought the DRB will take 'blow back' from this issue. This is THE character-defining element of this house and should be kept as close to historically accurate as possible. He noted there are other carriage doors in the historic district (eg the Harding House; house across from the post office etc). A lengthy discussion followed, with several options discussed, including automating the existing carriage doors to open out or creating one-piece automatic doors going up. Bob Escher indicated that he could make this latter option work. Hence this solution was correctly noted in the November minutes. With this single piece solution the

position and configuration of windows on the garage door wouldn't change and the historic handmade oversized hinges could be reused.

Note: the metal clad door on the west side of the house under the porch is approved only because you can't see it from the street.

Ms. Wallace moved to amend the minutes of the November meeting to clarify the window construction, dimensions and locations and approve those as presented on the revised drawing dated January 4, 2020. The porch facing Cheney Road is approved as drawn. The drawings as presented tonight are approved with the caveat that the windows will be numbered to correspond to the memo of December 14, 2019 and for clear understanding of the PC.

A. Gottlieb: 2<sup>nd</sup> Approved unanimously

Bob thanked the group for having the special meeting.

Adjournment: 7:10 PM

Kit Wallace, Chairman
Michael and Carol Smith
Bob Escher bob@escherdesigninc.com
Lawrence Caruso lscarusol@gmail.com